



Planning Department  
Jeremy Samuelson  
Director

# TOWN OF EAST HAMPTON

300 Pantigo Place – Suite 105  
East Hampton, New York 11937-2684

Telephone (631) 324-2178

## ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD EVALUATION HISTORIC DISTRICT 153 Deforest Road, Montauk SCTM#300-32-6-2

Prepared by: Tina Vavilis LaGarenne, AICP  
Assistant Planning Director

Date: June 15, 2023

### 1. APPLICATION INFORMATION

#### A. INFORMATION RECEIVED:

B. DATE SUBMITTED: May 18, 2023

C. OWNER: LJUM LLC

D. APPLICANT/AGENT: Tara Burke

E. SCHOOL DISTRICT: Montauk

F. STREET NAME: Deforest Road

G. TYPE OF STREET: Town

H. ZONING DISTRICT: A10: Residence, Montauk Association Historic District

I. OTHER REVIEW: N/A

J. MOST RECENT CERTIFICATE OF OCCUPANCY: C.O. 11402 (2618, 28850) - ROBERTA DONOVAN - 2-STORY, 1-FAMILY RESIDENCE, HAVING 1 KITCHEN ONLY, ERECTED BEFORE THE ADOPTION OF ZONING; 2-CAR GARAGE, 464 SQ. FT. 1ST FL., 464 SQ. FT. 2ND FL. ADDITION, 220 SQ. FT. INTERIOR ALTERATION TO RESIDENCE, 382 SQ. FT. DECKS, 116 SQ. FT. COVERED PORCH, 45 SQ. FT. PORTICO.

A. DESCRIPTION OF EXISTING STRUCTURES: Two-story single-family home; one of the original Montauk Association structures

#### B. DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED STRUCTURES:

##### a. Per applicant listing in application:

- i. Replace 23 windows (see historic/ non historic designation on windows schedule)
- ii. Replace 5 doors,
- iii. Remove railing on existing porch with addition of one step
- iv. Proposed repainting of trim, railings, balusters, porch wood apron and brackets, porch wood cornices and fascia, columns in proposed color Benjamin Moor Artic Seal.

- v. Removal existing exterior light fixtures and replace (five scones and five ceiling fixtures)
- vi. Replacement of brick patio with limestone
- b. Per plans and elevations submitted, other notable work elements:
  - i. Painting of historic door and replacement of existing clapboard siding in kind (page 12 of 23)
  - ii. Painting of wood deck (page 13 of 23)
  - iii. Entry walkway, providing stucco finish on wall (page 16 of 23)
- C. DIMENSIONS OF PROPOSED STRUCTURES: N/A
- D. HEIGHT OF PROPOSED STRUCTURES: N/A
- E. DOES EXISTING & PROPOSED LIGHTING COMPLY WITH BOARD POLICY? TBD

**Other Background Information:**

An application has been submitted to facilitate several proposed renovations of a residential property in the Montauk Association Historic District. The applicant is requesting to be allowed to replace several windows, remove railings, repaint trim and accent features and to replace the brick patio with limestone among other improvements as listed above. The applicant reports that only non-historic windows are proposed for replacement. According to the property card submitted with the application, a Stop Work Order was issued on April 21, 2023.

**Issues:**

**Survey**

The survey may not show all of the proposed structures; the applicant should confirm that all proposed work, including the proposed limestone patio which will replace the existing brick patio, stay within the existing footprint of the existing structures.

The survey should show the setbacks associated with the wetlands that existing on the northern area of the property as they relate to the proposed work to demonstrate whether or not they are out of Natural Resource Special Permit (NRSP) jurisdiction. The patio area appears to be within the 150 ft setback area, and therefore a NRSP is likely required.

**Historic Status**

153 Deforest Road is indicated in Chapter 255 Zoning Appendix D *Montauk Association Historic District Guidelines* as one of the seven original Montauk Association houses. Several specific guidelines apply to changes to these historic structures. §D-4 is attached with a listing of these. Particularly pertinent applicable standards that apply to this work are pasted below. The applicant should clearly demonstrate compliance with each of these and all standards within §D-4 that apply to the proposed scope.

A.

*Preserving original materials. Because these houses possess an extremely high level of historic and architectural significance, a principal goal of the historic district is to retain original materials.*

(1)

*Intact original materials should not be removed.*

(2)

*Deteriorated original materials should be repaired rather than replaced.*

(3)

*When severe deterioration makes replacement necessary, the new material should be an exact match of the original.*

G.

*Doorways. The wide Dutch entry doors of most of the houses are a hallmark of McKim, Mead & White's Shingle Style houses and convey the open relationship between the interior, the porch and the environment.*

(1)

*Review is required for any proposal to replace a door or components of a door enframement.*

(2)

*All significant elements of an original doorway, including the door, should be retained and repaired instead of replaced.*

(3)

*If replacement of any component is necessary, the new material should match that being replaced.*

(4)

*Installing a storm/screen door at any doorway is exempt from review.*

H.

*Windows The variety of window sashes which include different configurations of multipane sash and "Queen Anne sash" (a large single pane surrounded by a border of small panes) contributes to the informal nature of the houses. The house designs are also enlivened with distinctive window types such as the large stair hall windows, the triple-hung windows opening to porches, wheel windows, eyebrow windows and stained glass windows.*

(1)

*Original window casings and any decorative trim should be retained. If replacement is necessary, the new material should be an exact match of the existing material.*

(2)

*Original window sash should be retained. For any request to replace original window sash with new sash the Board will consider the following:*

(a)

*The contribution the window sash make to the historic character of the house and the condition of the sash.*

(b)

*Replacement sash should match the material, configuration and dimensions of all components of the original sash.*

(3)

*Storm windows and window screens are exempt from review.*

J.

*Porches. The many porches are one of the principal character-defining features of these Shingle Style houses. The porches convey the relationship of the houses to the environment and to the Atlantic Ocean. All the houses have broad porches across the front facade, many of which wrap around the side walls or have projecting bays. The Andrews House and the Benson House have second-story sleeping porches. The porches feature a variety of turned posts and boxed posts, spindle screens, brackets, open balustrades and shingled balustrades.*

(1)

*Original porches and their posts, balustrades and brackets should be retained. If replacement is necessary, the new material should be an exact match of the existing material.*

(2)

*Replacement of missing porch components should be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

The applicant should present to the Board their compliance with all the applicable requirements in §D-4 for the Board's consideration.

The property is also listed in the National Register of Historic Places. Accordingly, the applicant should seek comments from the State Historic Preservation Office to determine if they also have jurisdiction over changes to the property.

### **Lighting**

Pictures of the existing lighting were not provided. Per the application, five sconces and five ceiling fixtures are proposed to be changed and proposed fixtures on the lighting plan appear to be fully shielded which is appropriate. Per guidelines for the Montauk Association Historic District, (see below) a maximum wattage of 60 watts is permitted (this should be specified on the plans). A maximum color temperature of 3000K should also be specified; Kelvin is only specified for one fixture in the submission.

Guidelines from §D-3 regarding site lighting follow:

G.

*Exterior lighting. The restrained use of outdoor lighting helps to maintain the historic relationship between the houses and the natural environment. Existing lighting is primarily confined to incandescent fixtures within porches.*

(1)

*Porches and doorways are appropriate locations for light fixtures. Fixtures should use incandescent bulbs (60 watts maximum).*

*(2)*

*Site lighting should be confined to not more than three lanterns to illuminate driveways or parking areas. Fixtures should use incandescent bulbs (60 watts maximum).*

### **Plantings**

The north terrace landscaping plan shows areas of proposed native vegetation plantings. No details on species or vegetation extent is provided. The Board should discuss these plantings with the applicant and determine whether a Planting Plan be submitted.

### **Conclusion**

In conclusion, the Board should discuss whether or not the proposed project can meet its Standards and Criteria as provided in §255-7-60 and, specifically subsection B which sets forth factors for consideration in ARB decision making regarding historic landmarks or districts (see attached).